

# Millah

P-ISSN 1412-0992  
E-ISSN 2527-922X

JURNAL STUDI AGAMA

## DINAMIKA PEMIKIRAN MODERASI ISLAM

Religious Nation State: Bahtiar Effendy and Islamic Political Thought  
**Ali Akhbar Abaib Mas Rabbani Lubis**

Konsep Tasawuf Said Nursi: Implementasi Nilai-Nilai Moderasi Islam  
**Muhammad Faiz**

Pesantren Mlangi: Poros Spiritual Intelektual Islam  
di Yogyakarta Abad XVIII-XIX M  
**Dzulkifli Hadi Imawan**

An Analysis of The Divine Principles of  
K.H. Abdullah Syafi'ie (1910-1985 M)  
**Muhammad Choirin**

VOL. 19, No. 2 Februari 2020

# *Millah*

JURNAL STUDI AGAMA

Vol. 19, No. 2, Februari 2020

Nama Millah diambil dari QS. al-Hajj 78, yang berarti Thorieqoh, Jalan yang ingin dicapai. Jurnal Millah merupakan jurnal ilmiah yang terbit pertamakali pada tahun 2001, mengkaji dan meneliti bidang studi agama yang diterbitkan dua kali setahun secara tematik yaitu setiap bulan Februari dan Agustus.

## **Visi**

Menjadi salah satu referensi utama dalam bidang studi agama secara akademis baik nasional maupun internasional

## **Misi**

Media pencerahan studi agama dalam memecahkan masalah-masalah sosial-keagamaan

## **EDITORIAL TEAM**

### **Editor in Chief**

M. Roem Syibly

### **Managing Editor**

Yuli Andriansyah  
Dzulkifli Hadi Imawan

### **Editorial Advisory Board**

Junanah  
Yusdani  
Hujair AH Sanaky

### **Editorial Boards**

- M. Umer Chapra, Islamic Research and Training Institute of the Islamic Development Bank, Saudi Arabia
- Jasser Auda, President of Maqasid Institute Global, which is a think tank registered in the USA, UK, Malaysia and Indonesia, and has educational and research programs in a number of countries., Canada
- Philip Buckley, Department of Philosophy, McGill University, Canada

- Ahmad Munawar Ismail, Department of Theology and Philosophy, Faculty of Islamic Studies, The National University of Malaysia, Malaysia
- M. Amin Abdullah, Faculty of Ushuluddin, Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University, Indonesia, Indonesia
- Mohd Roslan Mohd Nor, Department of Islamic History And Civilization, Academy of Islamic Studies, University of Malaya, Malaysia
- Amir Mu'allim, Department of Islamic Law, Faculty of Islamic Studies, Islamic University of Indonesia, Indonesia, Indonesia
- Al Makin, Department of Sociology of Religion, Faculty of Ushuluddin, Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University, Indonesia
- Juhaya S. Praja, Sunan Gunung Djati State Islamic University, Indonesia
- Muhammad Irfan Helmy, IAIN Salatiga, Indonesia

### **Assistant to Editors**

Andi Musthafa Husain  
Miftahul Ulum

## Religious Nation State; Bahtiar Effendy and Islamic Political Thought

Ali Akhbar Abaib Mas Rabbani Lubis  
Pascasarjana, Studi Islam UIN Sunan Kalijaga (Yogyakarta)  
Email: lubismymarga@gmail.com

### Abstract

*This paper discusses the relevance and reflection of Bahtiar Effendy's thoughts on the relationship between Islam and the State, its aim is to affirmation the assumption that Bahtiar Effendy supports the secularization of Islam and the State even as the best solution. This paper is included in the cluster of qualitative research involving library research. This study uses data analysis conducted after a set of library documentation is obtained, then the data is reviewed and analyzed including data reduction, data display, then comes to the conclusion making stage. The research results obtained in this paper that Bahtiar Effendy is a Muslim scholar and professor of political science at UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta and Chairman of PP Muhammadiyah. The relevance and reflection of his thoughts on political Islam in Indonesia in his work do not consider secularization between Islam and the State as the best solution, instead, the contribution of Bahtiar Effendy's thought to a shifting of paradigm on Islamic politics from what previously led to formalism-legalism shifted into substantialism, without the need to be forced to make an Islamic state but enough to provide the substance of teaching (ethical/moral), then the Indonesian state deserves to be called the Religious Nation-State.*

**Keywords:** *Bahtiar Effendy, Relevance and Reflection, Religious Nation-State*

# Negara Bangsa yang Berketuhanan: Bahtiar Effendy Dan Pemikiran Politik Islam

Ali Akhbar Abaib Mas Rabbani Lubis  
Pascasarjana UIN Sunan Kalijaga (Yogyakarta)

## Abstrak

*Tulisan ini membahas relevansi dan refleksi pemikiran Bahtiar Effendy mengenai hubungan Islam dan Negara, tujuannya untuk mengafirmasi anggapan bahwa Bahtiar Effendy mendukung sekularisasi Islam dan Negara bahkan menjadi solusi terbaik. Tulisan ini masuk dalam cluster penelitian kualitatif dengan melibatkan studi kepustakaan (library research). Penelitian ini menggunakan analisis data yang dilakukan setelah seperangkat dokumentasi kepustakaan diperoleh, kemudian data tersebut ditelaah dan dianalisis meliputi reduksi data (data reduction), paparan-penyajian data (data display), lalu kemudian sampai pada tahap penarikan kesimpulan (conclusion making). Hasil penelitian yang di dapat dalam penulisan ini bahwa Bahtiar Effendy merupakan salah satu cendekiawan muslim dan sekaligus guru besar ilmu politik di UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta serta Ketua PP Muhammadiyah. Relevansi dan refleksi pemikirannya mengenai Islam politik di Indonesia dalam karyanya tidak menganggap sekularisasi antara Islam dan Negara sebagai solusi terbaik, justru Kontribusi pemikiran Bahtiar Effendy menapaki sifting of paradigm atas politik Islam dari yang sebelumnya mengarah pada formalisme-legalisme bergeser menjadi substansialisme, tanpa perlu dipaksakan menjadikan sebuah negara Islam tapi cukup memberikan substansi ajaran (etis/moral), maka negara Indonesia layak disebut sebagai Religious Nation State.*

**Kata Kunci:** *Bahtiar Effendy, Relevansi dan Refleksi, Religious Nation-State*

## INTRODUCTION

Discussing Bahtiar Effendy's thoughts regarding the relationship between Islam and the State needs to be rediscovered.

Indonesia, specifically related to the political issues of Islam and statehood, has been a very long debate in its history from pre-independence to post reform/amendment to the 1945 Constitution.<sup>1</sup> Formalism-legalism and exclusivity. Historical mapping is evident from the old order, namely the revolutionary period (1945-1949), liberal/parliamentary democracy (1955-1959) and despotic/guided democracy (1959-1966). Then the New Order despotic period (1966-1998). History proves that the movement of idealism and Islamic political activism completely failed and lost both parliamentary, rebellion (physical), and elections to bring Islam as the basis of the Indonesian state.<sup>2</sup>

The failure did not recede only to the point of the new order. Even after the collapse of the New Order period (May 21, 1998) until after the reform/amendment,<sup>3</sup> it turned out that Islamic political activism and idealism were still unable to realize Islamic symbolism-legalism itself. Although the discourse to realize an Islamic state still continues to this day, consider Pancasila and other pillars as the ideology of “*taghut*”.<sup>4</sup> Pancasila and its spectrum are as if vis-a-vis with Islam because it is not seen as Islamic; the struggle to realize

---

<sup>1</sup> Makhrus acknowledged that the seeds of this debate emerged openly in 1940, namely between Sukarno versus Muhammad Natsir in conflict around the relationship between religion and the State. The polemic was a continuation that occurred in 1918. Then it continued on the BPUPKI-PPKI in 1945, the Constituent Assembly in 1959, and after the 1998 reform since the 2000-2002 MPR Session. Makhrus, *Dinamika Hukum Islam Di Indonesia* (Yogyakarta: IERPRO KREASINDO, 2019), 231–39.

<sup>2</sup> Ali Akhbar Abaib Mas Rabbani Lubis, “Politik Ruang NKRI: BPUPK Sampai Majelis Konstituante,” *Shar-E: Jurnal Ekonomi Hukum Syariah* 6, no. 1 (2020): 34.

<sup>3</sup> State administration in Indonesia underwent a national reform that began in 1998 marked by fundamental amendments to the 1945 Constitution in four amendments from 1999, 2000, 2001, and 2002. Look Jimly Asshiddiqie, *Pengantar Hukum Tata Negara*, 8th ed. (Jakarta: Rajawali Pers, 2016), 2.

<sup>4</sup> Zakiyuddin Baidhawiy, “Pancasila Tauhid Sosial Dalam Kehidupan Berbangsa Dan Bernegara,” *Maarif* 11, no. 1 (2016): 42.

Islam as the basis of the state is a solution so that the nation becomes strong and respected.<sup>5</sup>

The phenomenon of the implementation of Pancasila as the basic Ideology of the state actually did not originate from the insecurity of Islamic sharia being made as to the basic ideology of the state (read: Indonesia), but the absence of strict and formally written orders from the texts of the Qur'an and the Hadith of the Prophet Muhammad, regarding the Islamic State. So that it can clearly articulate that an Islamic state is feasible to be applied in the State of Indonesia, as explained by Ahmad Syafi'i Ma'arif that:

*"...sekalipun kelompok modernis telah banyak berbicara tentang sebuah negara berdasarkan islam pada periode pasca kemerdekaan, namun sayangnya belum seorang pun diantara mereka yang telah berhasil menyusun suatu karya sistematis dan ilmiah, yang mampu mengartikulasi hakikat dan corak suatu negara Islam yang ingin mereka ciptakan di Indonesia".<sup>6</sup>*

The journey between the relationship between Islam and the State in Indonesia is very complex when looking at the historical context and its movements. Despite the existing problems, Indonesia, in essence, is very clear that it does not secularize between religion (Islam) and the state as Kemal Attaturk had done in Turkey in 1928,<sup>7</sup> but the State with proof of renewal has actually accommodated everything related to religion in general. So that Indonesia as a country by Mahfud MD is more simplified as a "Religious Nation State"<sup>8</sup> in which it does not completely neglect religion as a complement to a

---

<sup>5</sup> MK Ridwan, "Penafsiran Pancasila Dalam Perspektif Islam: Peta Konsep Integrasi," *Dalogia* 15, no. 2 (2017): 206.

<sup>6</sup> Ahmad Syafii Maarif, *Islam Dan Masalah Kenegaraan; Studi Tentang Percaturan Dalam Konstituante* (Jakarta: LP3ES, 1985), 125.

<sup>7</sup> Soekarno, "Memudakan Pengertian Islam", *Dalam Di Bawah Bendera Revolusi*, IV, 1965, 370; Moh. Mahfud MD, *Perdebatan Hukum Tata Negara; Pasca Amandemen Konstitusi* (Jakarta: Rajawali Pers, 2010), 235-37.

<sup>8</sup> Borrowing Mahfud MD's statement states expressly that "...pancasila adalah religious nation state bukan negara agama (yang menganut suatu agama tertentu), dan bukan Negara sekuler (yang hampa agama)". MD, *Perdebatan Hukum Tata Negara; Pasca Amandemen Konstitusi*, 243.

country. However, in Devi Adrianti's research in reading the conclusions of Bahtiar Effendy's dissertation, the recognition of the secularization of the relationship between Islam and the state/politics in the future is very significant and becomes the best solution.<sup>9</sup> Interestingly, to arrive at these conclusions, Devi Adrianti only read the conclusions from Bahtiar Effendy's research in his book entitled "Islam dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran dan Praktik Politik Islam di Indonesia".<sup>10</sup>

The discussion above at least provides an illustration that this research occupies an important position in glancing at the relevance and reflection of Bahtiar Effendy's thoughts in his works such as "Islam dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran dan Praktik Politik Islam di Indonesia"<sup>11</sup>, "Islam and the State in Indonesia: Munawir Sjadzali and the Development of a New Theological Underpinning of Political Islam"<sup>12</sup>, and several others about the relationship between Islam and the State. An important objective in this research is to affirm Bahtiar Effendy's thoughts about the relationship between Islam and the State, especially noting that he passed away in November 2019. Thus, this research is the first study specifically talks about the relevance and reflection of Bahtiar Effendy's thoughts after he deceased.

## METHODOLOGY

This paper is a qualitative research with library research. This study uses data analysis conducted after a set of library documentation is obtained, then the data is analyzed and analyzed

---

<sup>9</sup> Devi Adrianti, "Sekularisme Sebagai Dasar Konseptualisasi (Telaah Atas Disertasi Noorhaidi Hasan, Bahtiar Effendi Dan Masdar Hilmy Yang Memakai Pendekatan Ilmu Sosial Terhadap Politik Islam Di Indonesia)," *In Right: Jurnal Agama Dan Hak Azazi Manusia* 3, no. 1 (2013): 69–86.

<sup>10</sup> Adrianti, 72.

<sup>11</sup> This book originates from Bahtiar Effendy dissertation with its original title, *Islam and The State: The Transformation of Islamic Political Ideas and Practices in Indonesia*, dissertation, The Ohio State University, 1994

<sup>12</sup> This article is largely developed from Bahtiar Effendy Dissertation. Article published by *Studia Islamika: Indonesian Journal for Islamic Studies*, Volume 2, Number 2, 1995.

including data reduction, data display-delivery then comes to the conclusion making stage. This methodology specifically addresses the research problem namely what is the intellectual journey of Bahtiar Effendy? and what is the relevance and reflection of thought in his work?.

## BAHTIAR EFFENDY BIOGRAPHY

Bahtiar Effendy's is one of political experts and observers, who focuses on Islamic politics. He was born in December 10, 1958, in Ambarawa, Central Java. After completing primary and secondary schools, he continued his studies to Pabelan boarding school, Muntilan, Central Java. He then went to Columbia Falls Middle School, Columbia Falls, Montana, United States on a scholarship from the American Field Service (AFS) in 1976-1977. Then he continued to IAIN (now UIN) Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta at the Ushuludin Faculty, Ciputat, Jakarta in 1979-1985.<sup>13</sup> After that, he continued to University of Ohio, Athens, United States in Southeast Asia Study Program from 1986-1988. Finally, in 1988-1994, he completed his doctoral degree in Political Science at Ohio State University, Columbus.<sup>14</sup>

In addition to being active in the world of television media to talk about politics, Bahtiar Effendy also published several scientific works, including:<sup>15</sup> *Merambah Jalan Baru Islam: Rekonstruksi Pemikiran Islam Indonesia Masa Orde Baru* (1986), *The Nine Stars and Politics; A Study of Nahdlatul Ulama's Acceptance of Asas Tunggal* and its Withdrawal from politics, Thesis, Ohio University (1988), *Islam and the State; Transformasi of Islamic Political Ideas and Practices in Indonesia*, Dissertation, Ohio State University (1994), *Islam dan Negara*;

---

<sup>13</sup> Ali dan Fachry and Bahtiar Effendy, *Merambah Jalan Baru Islam; Rekonstruksi Pemikiran Islam Masa Orde Baru*, III (Bandung: Mizan, 1992), halaman akhir; Bahtiar Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia* (Jakarta: Paramadina, 1998), halaman akhir.

<sup>14</sup> Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, halaman akhir.

<sup>15</sup> <https://tirto.id/bahtiar-effendy-meninggal-profil-dan-jejak-kariernya-el4w>, diakses pada 11 Mei 2020 pada pukul 02: 44.

*Transformasi Pemikiran dan Praktek Politik Islam di Indonesia*, Jakarta, Paramadina (1998), *Repolitisasi Islam, Benarkah Islam Kembali Berpolitik* (2000), *Teologi Baru Politik Islam*, Yogyakarta, Galang (2001).

In addition, there are several other works, such as, *Hak Azasi Manusia dalam Islam, Masyarakat Agama dan Pluralisme Keagamaan, Teologi Baru Politik Islam, Jalan Tengah Politik Islam, Islam in the Contemporary Indonesia Politics, Kalla dan Perdamaian Aceh, Agama Publik dan Prioat, Beringin Membangun; Sejarah Politik Partai GOLKAR, Integrasi Nasional diantara Sistem Demokrasi dan Otoriter di Indonesia, Pemikiran dan Gerakan Islam Radikal Pasca Orde Baru*, and others.<sup>16</sup> Some of his journal articles included "Islam and the State in Indonesia: Munawir Sjadzali and the Develoment of a New Theological Underpinning of Political Islam", *Studia Islamika*, Vol. 2, No. 2 (1995), "Putting all the Cards on the Table Trust as a actor in the War Against Terror", *Institute of Strategic and International Studies*, Malaysia (2008), "The *Payung* and Rising Sun: A Study of Javanese *Pangreh Praja* during the Japanese Occupation 1942-1945", *Studia Islamika*, Vol. 16, No. 3 (2009), Indonesia's Democratic Venture: History, Practice and the Challenge Ahead, *Studia Islamika*, Vol. 19, No. 3 (2012).

Bahtiar Effendy's began his career early as the editorial staff of the Panji Magazine and Mizan journals. He also worked for the Asia and Pacific Mosque Council.<sup>17</sup> After that, he worked as the Deputy Director of the Indonesian Institute for Business Ethics and Development (LSPEU Indonesia), as well as taught at the Postgraduate Program of IAIN (UIN) Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta,

---

<sup>16</sup> There are many more works that have been published by Bahtiar Effendy, more details can be seen in, <https://scholar.google.com/citations?hl=id&user=CG8VfvAAAAAJ>.

<sup>17</sup> Fachry and Effendy, *Merambah Jalan Baru Islam; Rekonstruksi Pemikiran Islam Masa Orde Baru*, halaman akhir.

Jakarta Muhammadiyah University, and the University of Indonesia.<sup>18</sup>  
Bahtiar Effendy's career path is shown in the following table.<sup>19</sup>

**Tabel 1.** Intellectual Lunge

No	Intellectual Careers	Year
1	UIN Postgraduate Lecturer, UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta	Since 1995
2	Postgraduate Lecturer, University of Indonesia	Since 1995
3	Postgraduate lecturer, Muhammadiyah University	Since 1996
4	Deputy Director of The Institute for The Study and Advancement of Business Ethic	Since 1996
5	Chairperson of the UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Postgraduate Academy Academic Board, Jakarta	Since 1999
6	Head of the Postgraduate Study Program, Jakarta Muhammadiyah University	2001-2004
7	Professor of Political Science at UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta	2006
8	Dean of FISIP UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta	Since 2009
9	Senior Fellow, S. Rajaratman University of Internasional	-

---

<sup>18</sup> Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, halaman akhir.

<sup>19</sup> <https://m.merdeka.com/profil/indonesia/b/bahtiar-effendy/> di Unduh pada 09 Januari 2020 Pukul 22:13.

10	Visiting researcher, Nanyang Tecnological University, Singapura.	Maret 2007- Februari 2008
11	Political and religious expert	-
12	Member, American Political Science Association (APSA)	-
13	Member, World Conference on Religion and Peace (WCRP)	-
14	Member, Ikatan Cendekiawan Muslim Indonesia (ICMI)	-
15	Member, Asosiasi Ilmu Politik Indonesia	-

Effendy's career was mainly related to youth issues during the New Order era including youth, religious and journalistic meetings in various cities in Southeast Asia, Tokyo, Colombo, Nairobi, London and several other European countries. In early 1986, the United States Government and the East-West Center invited him to attend a Journalist Workshop on issues of Political Economy and Security in the Asia Pacific, Honolulu, Hawaii. That year, Effendy also participated in observations and studies in various Indonesian and Islamic Studies institutions in the United States with the sponsorship of the Asia Foundation.<sup>20</sup> Bahtiar Effendy passed away at the age of 60, on Wednesday, November 21, 2019.<sup>21</sup>

## ISLAMIC LEGAL-FORMAL DYNAMICS OF ISLAM

Pre-independence Indonesia in its movement has proven as the forerunner in the growth of Islamic political seeds started from an

---

<sup>20</sup> Fachry and Effendy, *Merambah Jalan Baru Islam; Rekonstruksi Pemikiran Islam Masa Orde Baru*, halaman akhir.

<sup>21</sup> <https://jakarta.tribunnews.com/2019/11/21/profil-bahtiar-effendy-ketua-pp-muhammadiyah-meninggal-usia-60-sd-di-ambarawa-kuliah-di-as>. Diakses pada 11 Mei 2020 pada pukul 03: 28.

organization under the leadership of HOS Tjokrominoto, Agus Salim and Abdoel Muis, namely SI (Sarekat Islam) which not only demanded independence for Indonesia but wanted full support in all walks of life.<sup>22</sup> SI as the first Islamic political party has given its own colour in the renewal of Islam because seeing from the goal is to increase the ukhuwah Islamiyah, improve people's lives in order to achieve prosperity, independence, and state freedom.<sup>23</sup>

SI struggle in demanding independence does not recede only to its decline as a party. It indirectly encourages many Islamic movements to appear as reformers with the model of an Islamic state in a legal-formal manner in politics, even though many groups disagree (including reformers and nationalists). Hence, it becomes the forerunner to the growth of Islamic political ideas that are legal-formal in nature.<sup>24</sup>

Islamic politics in the context of Bahtiar Effendy's thought ranged from the State's independence to the end of the New Order government, certainly cannot be separated from the similar ideas and movements of its predecessors regarding Islamic politics which aspires to have a legal-formal model. Nevertheless, we need to see to which extent the political phenomenon of Islam gives colour to the problem of Indonesia. Bahtiar Effendy follows four theoretical approaches, namely, confessionalization of Islam, domestication of

---

<sup>22</sup> Sarekat Islam (SI) managed to get support from various walks of life, cities, villages, Muslim traders, Kyais, clerics, *priyayi*, farmers and workers, even during the 4 years of its establishment Sarekat Islam managed to gather as many as 360,000 members and in the year 1919 has reached approximately 2.5 million. Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 64; George McTurnan Kahin, *Nationalism and Revolution in Indonesia* (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1952), 65–66.

<sup>23</sup> Fachry and Effendy, *Merambah Jalan Baru Islam; Rekonstruksi Pemikiran Islam Masa Orde Baru*, 75–79.

<sup>24</sup> Starting from the firm statement of Tjokroaminoto, Agus Salim and Abdoel Moeis (*Tiga Serangkai*) that symbolically that SI had Islamic ideology that was in line with the ideals of the Pan-Islamism movement in the Middle East. Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 67.

Islam, schismatics and flow, trichotomy, and cultural Islam.<sup>25</sup> The approach, from a theoretical perspective, has its own theoretical foundation, especially in manifesting a style of relationship and political orientation between Islam and the State. *How does the theory approach speak?, how far is the relevance of the description of the history of political Islam discussed by Bahtiar Effendy?, and what is the reflection of Bahtiar Effendy's thought?* will be explained in the following section.

### **1. 'Deconfessionalization' of Islam**

This 'deconfessionalization'<sup>26</sup> approach seeks to subjugate all types of religious doctrines that are legal-formal in politics and constitution by offering "concepts that are used to broaden public acceptance, including all interested groups, to Muslim concepts", certainly more to the consideration of shared humanity.<sup>27</sup> It needs to be applied as the basis of the Indonesian state. Besides, it is proven that it has been defeated in various political and constitutional battles and bureaucratic debates in the history of politics in Indonesia.

The struggle for the Revolution (1945-1950) between Islam and Nationalists on Independence politically continued from the formation of the Advisory Council and the Indonesian Independence Efforts Investigation Board (BPUPKI) and the Indonesian Independence Preparatory Committee (PPK).<sup>28</sup> The Islamic group that supports legal-formal Islamic politics ideology was led by Ki Bagus

---

<sup>25</sup> These approaches were taken and developed from several figures such as C.A.O Van Nieuwenhuijze, Harry J. Benda, Modjokuto (Clifford Geertz and Robert R. Jay), Allan Samson and Donald K. Emerson. which is contained in and summarized in a work written by Bahtiar Effendy to see how far the context could be felt during the New Order era. Effendy, 23-47.

<sup>26</sup> This approach was developed by C.A.O. Van Nieuwenhuijze, as this theory was borrowed to accommodate between Dutch socio-cultural and political groups for the purpose of formulating a basis for mutual agreement and for mutual consideration, more importantly, a number of doctrines about religion (worship) were more avoided as a topic of discussion on the basis of consideration shared humanity. Effendy, 23-28.

<sup>27</sup> Effendy, 26-27.

<sup>28</sup> Ali Akhbar Abaib Mas Rabbani Lubis, "Politik Ruang NKRI: BPUPK Sampai Majelis Konstituante," 34-39.

Hadikusumo, Abdul Kahar Mudzakkir, Abi Kusno Tjokrosujoso, and A. Wahid Hasyim. Whereas the nationalist groups that support the state must be deconfessionalized were Sukarno, Hatta and Soepomo. In the end, fierce debate happened was finalized by mutual agreement (*modus vivendi*) that the Indonesian state was based on Pancasila.<sup>29</sup>

The struggle for Islamic politics in the first election (1955-1959) through sessions in the Constituent Assembly showed that the legal, formal, and scripturative attitude of Islam never subsided, even though it was eventually dissolved through Presidential Decree in 5 July 1959 to return to the 1945 Constitution. Indonesia from 1950 to 1957 known with its Constitutional Democracy which means that it relied on a governance system under the 1950 Constitution.<sup>30</sup> The failure of Political Islam in its first general election on 29 September 1995 that Masyumi and PNI each gained 57 seats out of a total of 257 seats, NU 45 seats, PKI 39 seats, and other parties with less than 10 seats.<sup>31</sup> Therefore, the Islamic group only controls 43,5% of the seats.<sup>32</sup> Tasnur and Zulkarnain's research seems to be mistaken about the data acquisition on the vote seats, stating that Masyumi and NU obtained 57 and 47 seats;<sup>33</sup> moreover, the study does not include references as a reference. In spite of these mistakes, the foundations of the Indonesian

---

<sup>29</sup> In the second plenary session on July 10-16, BPUPKI actually succeeded in agreeing and agreeing on the Jakarta Charter, which in its Preamble drafting acknowledged Islam as the basis of a special State for Muslims as set out in the first precept with the phrase "Godhead with the obligation to carry out Islamic Sharia for its adherents. ". But the direction of history began to veer at the Session of the PPKI and was jointly endorsed for the sake of the Unity of the State. MD, *Perdebatan Hukum Tata Negara; Pasca Amendemen Konstitusi*, 238-42; Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 85-92; Maarif, *Islam Dan Masalah Kenegaraan; Studi Tentang Percaturan Dalam Konstituante*, 101-10.

<sup>30</sup> Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 94.

<sup>31</sup> Maarif, *Islam Dan Masalah Kenegaraan; Studi Tentang Percaturan Dalam Konstituante*, 122.

<sup>32</sup> Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 105.

<sup>33</sup> Tasnur Irvan and Zulkarnain, "Akar Dan Perkembangan Konservatisme Islam Dalam Perpolitikan Indonesia," *Jurnal Review Politik* 9, no. 1 (2019): 61.

state have been successfully 'deconfessionalized' the reconfiguration.

On political struggle during New Order era (1967-1998), Suharto closed the debate on the basis of the state through Presidential Decree No. 13/1968. Even in 1983, the government made Pancasila a single principle for political parties and mass organizations. So that, Islamic political activists to make the state legal, formal, and scripturative principle which is difficult to fight for.<sup>34</sup> This was due to fears of regional uprisings by Muslims so claimed the lives of 25,000 civilians, 120,000 houses were destroyed and burned, and material lost reached 650 million occurred around 1949-1962.<sup>35</sup> Another reference is that the lives of 22,950 and 115,282 houses have disappeared.<sup>36</sup> The New Order government during the Soeharto era for the umpteenth time succeeded in deconfiguring the state of the state based on Pancasila. Undeniably, the consequences of this 'deconfessionalization' also received a strong response from political figures and religious organizations, as explained by Zuhri, for example:

*"Dewan Dakwah Islamiyah Indonesia (DDII), organisasi modernis radikal pimpinan Mohammad Natsir, mengeluarkan reaksi paling keras. Mereka menerbitkan sebuah pamflet yang menolak keras asas tunggal dengan asumsi bahwa hal itu adalah lanjutan dari proyek sekularisasi dan depolitisasi Islam Indonesia... Sedangkan Pelajar Islam Indonesia (PII), suatu organisasi yang berafiliasi dengan*

---

<sup>34</sup> MD, *Perdebatan Hukum Tata Negara; Pasca Amandemen Konstitusi*, 242. Zuhri Humaidi in his special explanation in his sub-theme on "single principle politics" reaffirmed that the state speech of the Soeharto President in front of the Plenary Session of the Indonesian House of Representatives on August 16, 1982, on a single principle was legitimized by the provisions of the 1983 General Assembly which was further strengthened through Law No. 3 of 1985 concerning Party and Normality, it regulates the rejection of other principles aside from the Pancasila Principle. Zuhri Humaidi, "Islam Dan Pancasila: Pergulatan Islam Dan Negara Periode Kebijakan Asas Tunggal," *Kontekstualitas* 25, no. 2 (2010): 295.

<sup>35</sup> Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 95-100.

<sup>36</sup> Irvan and Zulkarnain, "Akar Dan Perkembangan Konservatisme Islam Dalam Perpolitikan Indonesia," 61.

*kelompok modernis, sampai dengan batas akhir yang diberikan pemerintah, tetap tidak mau mengganti asas Islam dengan Pancasila... Tanggapan lebih rumit dilakukan oleh Himpunan Mahasiswa Islam (HMI). Dalam prosesnya itu, HMI pecah menjadi dua kubu, yaitu kelompok sempalan yang menolak Pancasila sebagai asas dan menamakan diri HMI Majelis Penyelamat Organisasi (MPO), dan kelompok HMI Diponegoro yang menerima asas tunggal...penolakan lain oleh kelompok-kelompok sempalan Muslim lainnya yang menyulut peristiwa Tanjung Priok pada September 1984".<sup>37</sup>*

However, this confessionalization effort was fully accepted by Muhammadiyah and NU as the largest Islamic mass organization in Indonesia because the Pancasila issue had been resolved long before it agreed as the basis of the state on August 18, 1945. In addition, Muhammadiyah and NU figures participated in the formulation of Pancasila. So that Muhammadiyah in its 1986 conference accepted Pancasila as the sole principle and NU in its 1984 conference unanimously set Pancasila as its organizational principle.<sup>38</sup>

## **2. Domestication of Islam**

The domestication<sup>39</sup> of Islamic approach originated from the groups represented by Demak (Islamic Kingdom) against Mataram kingdom, the defeat and conquest of the orthodox kingdoms on the coast of Java (Demak) by Mataram (syncretic Islamic orientation) is the forerunner to domestication continues to grow even though it has been developed. Until post-independence, it was seen that this orientation (a group of secular scholars) continued to reject the idea of an Islamic state that was proposed by Islamic groups. Like the

---

<sup>37</sup> Humaidi, "Islam Dan Pancasila: Pergulatan Islam Dan Negara Periode Kebijakan Asas Tunggal," 297-99.

<sup>38</sup> Humaidi, 298-300.

<sup>39</sup> The Domesticated Approach to Islam is often linked to the work of Harry J. Benda about Islam in Indonesia. Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 28-31. More about this theory can be seen in his work, "Continuity and Change in Indonesia Islam", *Asia and African Studies: Annual of Israel Oriental Studies*, Vol 1, 1965, 123-138.

crackdown on the Darul Islam (DI) movement, Dissolution of the Masjumi,<sup>40</sup> Presidential Decree July 5, 1959,<sup>41</sup> and Presidential Instruction (Inpres) No. 13 of 1969.<sup>42</sup>

It is very clear that one of the elements of domestication that has developed is the struggle for power between Islamic groups to date that wants legal-formal and exclusive rights in the basis of the Indonesian State (as shown by PPP, PKS, and other Islamic parties) with Nationalist groups (non-Islamic elements) in Indonesian society (as shown by PDI, Golkar and others) defending or strengthening nationalist' ideas and defending the Pancasila state. Domestically, the Islamic group was defeated by the last group in order to make efforts in order to achieve the same goal.

### 3. Schismatic and Cluster Group

The schismatic and cluster grouping's<sup>43</sup> approach generally begins with a group mapping between *santri* (pure Islamist), *abangan* (syncretic Muslims from Javanese/animism) and *priyayi* (syncretic Islam and Hinduism). The *santri* group in its current concept leaned toward political orientation of Masyumi or NU partisan party, the *abangan* and *priyayi* groups in their political orientations tended to PNI or PKI parties.<sup>44</sup> The schismatic and cluster grouping certainly has different ideas. To maintain their ideas it often changes shape even though the vision adopted is still the same; whether the party changes towards community organizations or vice versa.

---

<sup>40</sup> Effendy, 29-30.

<sup>41</sup> President Sukarno at that time received support from the Military, as well as marking a political system of Guided Democracy and the stagnation in the development of Islamic politics. Maarif, *Islam Dan Masalah Kenegaraan; Studi Tentang Percaturan Dalam Konstituante*, 175-82.

<sup>42</sup> MD, *Perdebatan Hukum Tata Negara; Pasca Amandemen Konstitusi*, 242.

<sup>43</sup> This theory comes from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) research team in Ethnographic studies in the 1950s. The field study began in a village in East Java, under the pseudonym Modjokuto and this theory is more identified in the writings of Robert R. Jay and Clifford Geertz. Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 31-40.

<sup>44</sup> Effendy, 39.

#### 4. Trichotomy

The trichotomy<sup>45</sup> approach has three opposing orientation characteristics and its explanation, according to Effendy, refers to Allan Samson's term which includes:

*"...Fundamentalists affirm a strict, puristic interpretation of Islam, opposes secular thought and Western influence as well as the syncretism of traditionalist belief, and insist on the primacy of religion over politics. Reformists also theoretically stress the primacy of religion over politics, but they are far more willing than fundamentalists to cooperate with secular groups on a sustained basis. They are also concerned with making the faith relevant to the modern age. Accommodationists value the framework of unity provided by Islam, but maintain that social and economic interests should be given priority by Islamic organizations. They further stress the necessity of acknowledging the legitimate interests of secular groups and cooperating with them on a sustained basis."*<sup>46</sup>

The Indonesian political face, in his perspective, is seen about the Fundamentalists group assuming that the only legitimate political power is the political power of Islam which refers to legal-formal and exclusive rights. Meanwhile, the reformist and accommodationist groups do not adhere to such matters. Nonetheless, as it is not hostile to Islam, such secular power can be considered legitimate.<sup>47</sup> Bahtiar Effendy's states that:

*"...both reformists and accommodationists were willing to accept ideological compromise in exchange for political concessions. The political leadership of these factions was clearly more pragmatic:*

---

<sup>45</sup> This theory is more widely used in the works of Allan Samson by seeing that the defeat of Islamic parties was due to political and ideological divisions within it. Effendy, 41.

<sup>46</sup> Bahtiar Effendy, "Islam and The State: The Transformation of Islamic Political Ideas and Practices in Indonesia" (The Ohio State University, 1994), 44.

<sup>47</sup> Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 43.

*association with secular authorities was permissible so long as it benefitted group they represented".<sup>48</sup>*

Legal-formal and exclusive political agenda, according to the quote, is neglected because it cannot escape from external barriers and internal frustration. To achieve its ideals and political objectives, Islam needs to be improved to a closer line, to realistic achievement lines. Therefore, it can provide broad moral guidance through ethical formulations that legitimize public policy.<sup>49</sup>

## 5. Cultural Islam

Cultural Islam<sup>50</sup> approach, according to Emmerson, starts by seeing Indonesia in 1980s, especially in reaffirming a cultural dimension that is more substantial-inclusive and completely non-political. The approach views the weight of cultural Islam which can influence the government in offering a number of concessions to Muslims.<sup>51</sup> In his discussion, Bahtiar Effendy mentions:

*"Pengunduran diri NU dari PPP pada penghujung 1980-an adalah satu diantara kasus-kasus paling menarik yang dapat dilihat dari kerangka pemahaman baru ini. Keputusan organisasi itu untuk kembali ke khittah 1926, tahun organisasi itu didirikan di Surabaya, dalam satu pengertian adalah penarikan diri secara politis. Tetapi hal ini hanya benar dalam pengertian politik partisan (yaitu dari PPP). Penarikan diri itu tidak dimaksudkan untuk melupakan aspirasi-aspirasi yang lebih kultural. Demikianlah, dilihat dari gerak peralihannya sepanjang sekitar sepuluh tahun terakhir ini dengan menjadikan dirinya sebagai salah satu komponen terpenting dalam*

---

<sup>48</sup> Effendy, "Islam and The State: The Transformation of Islamic Political Ideas and Practices in Indonesia," 46.

<sup>49</sup> Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 44-45.

<sup>50</sup> This Islamic culture approach was developed by Donald K. Emmerson by looking at the historical perspective that the formulation of this theory is based on the political defeat of Muslims both in the constitution, physical, electoral, bureaucratic, and symbols to re-deploy by developing the non-political side so that avoid political rivalry and other groups in order to regrow the awareness, diversity, and social aspects of followers. Effendy, 45-46.

<sup>51</sup> Effendy, 46-47.

*bangunan masyarakat madani (civil society), manuver diatas pada dasarnya bersifat politis.*<sup>52</sup>

The origin of ideas' substantial reformulation starts from the cultural passion of Islamic vehicle and efforts to connect the political relations between Islam and the State in an integrated way. This intellectual stream (modernists) essentially calls for a more transformative movement by establishing close relations with the state (i.e. relevant bureaucratic offices) to facilitate a more substantive Islamic political program. Bahtiar Effendy, in an interview with Adi Sasono in Jakarta, 4 September 1991, in regard to transformative calls,<sup>53</sup> observes:

- a. a broader meaning of politics, which in its most basic sense, encompasses more diverse programs, strategies and arenas, not just the struggle for partisan interests with parliament as the only arena.
- b. fostered relations that are more useful with the state and other organizations, especially those who have the same concerns.
- c. formulation and redefinition of Islamic political ideals which are inclusive in nature, to censor (not contradict) both Islamic and Indonesian dimensions.

The explanation provides an overview on each use of theoretical perspectives and their relevance. Reflections on the perspective used summarized by Bahtiar Effendy as:

*"It is clear from the beginning that the 'deconfessionalization' perspective offered a constructive explanation of the antagonistic political relationship between Islam and the state. Benda's work analyzed the implications of political antagonism (i.e the domestication of Islam), and both Jay and Geertz advanced theoretical framework to relate the religio-cultural roots of antagonism to the patterns of cleavage in Indonesian politics. Samson tried to elaborate conceptually the diversity of political behavior of the Muslim, both*

---

<sup>52</sup> Effendy, 47.

<sup>53</sup> Effendy, 168.

*from the modernist and traditionalist camps, which developed in the seventies. And Emerson attempted to offer a novel theoretical explanation of Indonesian Islam's cultural strength".<sup>54</sup>*

Approaches built tend to function in the assumption that the relationship between Islam and politics cannot be separated; therefore, the tendency affects alignment between Islam and politics. Bahtiar Effendy asserts that such relationship is structurally bound or confined by a formal Islamic religious system.<sup>55</sup> Bahtiar Effendy expresses it as identifying political Islam with Islamic political parties. Consequently, political affiliation functions as a criterion for determining whether a person belongs to Islam or not.<sup>56</sup> This is what researchers refer to Islam will be biased if Islamic religious archetypes are politicized.

The reading of contemporary Islam in Indonesia, in Bahtiar Effendy's viewpoint, needs to be seen through a combination of symbiosis from an existing perspective by combining some elements of 'deconfessionalization', cultural perspective, and diversity of Islamic political forms. At the same time, character that views Islam and politics/state is inseparable. Even, the identification of political Islam with Islamic parties, which affects political affiliation, serves as a criterion for determining whether a person belongs to Islam or not. As mentioned earlier, the reasoning must be rejected.<sup>57</sup>

## **SUBSTANSIALISM**

Islam and politics in their historical maps are seen in a very organic and indisputable relationship, when it is seen from 'deconfessionalization' approach, Islamic domestication, schismatics and grouping, and trichotomy. Firm evidence on Islamic politics leads

---

<sup>54</sup> Effendy, "Islam and The State: The Transformation of Islamic Political Ideas and Practices in Indonesia," 50-51.

<sup>55</sup> Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 48-49.

<sup>56</sup> Effendy, 52.

<sup>57</sup> Effendy, 55-56.

to legal-formal status and even exclusive to state application which always fails and leads to defeat. It shows that politics and Islam are still incomprehensible in a substantial (ethical/moral) sense. Moreover, history has presented many cases regarding Islamic politics in the past.

Islamic politics certainly will never end at any time; however, to bring Islamic politics back into today's national politics arena requires an approach which is more openly accepted and has a substantial pattern.<sup>58</sup> As an example, a new approach brought by NU in 1984,<sup>59</sup> which accepted Pancasila as a single principle, as stated by KH. Ahmad Shiddiq.

*"Ideologi pancasila adalah final berkenaan dengan fungsinya sebagai dasar kehidupan bernegara dan bermasyarakat dalam konteks kemajemukan Indonesia. Kefinalan itu juga berkenaan dengan perumusan atau pengkalimatan formalnya sebagaimana tercantum dalam pembukaan UUD 1945".<sup>60</sup>*

The new generation of Muslim intellectuals had clearly begun to show a substantial approach to social doctrine. Looking at previous history, the legal-formal style has symbolically become a taboo and cannot be applied anymore; however, it requires a new approach that is more progressive and inclusive. As described by Bahtiar:

*"...it is safe to conclude that attempts to redefine the new socio-political aspirations of Islam fall into two important headings: (1) the development of egalitarian and democratic political arrangements; and (2) the inception of equitable economic processes.<sup>61</sup>*

It is clear that pattern of the movement must begin with a non-political approach (so called, partisan politics). It basically still contains political elements, only the pattern has changed and its

---

<sup>58</sup> Effendy, 57.

<sup>59</sup> Hisanori, *Agama Dan Peradaban* (Jakarta: Dian Rakyat, 2011), 109.

<sup>60</sup> Madjid Nurcholish and dkk, *Islam Universal* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2007), 178.

<sup>61</sup> Effendy, "Islam and The State: The Transformation of Islamic Political Ideas and Practices in Indonesia," 220.

departure needs to be preceded by the ideas and Islamic culture approach, since in three decades of the New Order regime, government had succeeded in restructuring political parties only into PPP, PDI, and Golkar, created uniformity or single principle in political and socio-religious organizations, unified the four branches of the armed forces, generated policies on religious and racial issues, and produced power centralization. Thus, they are kept away from the noise and even relatively docile<sup>62</sup> political situations, especially in the context of political activity in the name of Islam. It, of course, leads to less space in the national political arena because Islamic politics orientation tends to be rigid.<sup>63</sup> Naturally, the context leads to a substansialistic pattern because regional, ethnics, religious-ideological, and political tensions are far less effective; also, it is hegemonic.<sup>64</sup>

Bahtiar Effendy's thoughts is still relevant to date; moreover, it is consistently and precisely reinforced in the 2015 Muhammadiyah Congress which reiterates that Pancasila State is *dar al-'ahdi* (a result of consensus) and *dar al-syahadah* (a vessel of proof or testimony) and *dar al-salam* (a safe and peaceful country).<sup>65</sup> NU has rejected the idea of Islamic state system at its 11<sup>th</sup> Congress in Banjarmasin, 1935 and agreed to Pancasila as the country's basis at its 27<sup>th</sup> Congress in Situbondo, 1983. The consistency was reinforced at the 33<sup>rd</sup> Congress in Jombang, 2015 with its theme *Meneguhkan Islam Nusantara untuk*

---

<sup>62</sup> Bahtiar Effendy, "Integrasi Nasional di Antara Sistem Demokrasi dan Otoriter di Indonesia", dalam PPP MPR RI, *Islam, Nasionalisme, Dan Masa Depan Negara Bangsa Indonesia; Pandangan Para Ahli Dan Aktivois* (PPP MPR RI, 2009), 291.

<sup>63</sup> Bahtiar Effendy, "Islam and the State in Indonesia: Munawir Sjadzali and the Development of a New Theological Underpinning of Political Islam," *Studia Islamica* 2, no. 2 (1995): 103-4.

<sup>64</sup> RI, *Islam, Nasionalisme, Dan Masa Depan Negara Bangsa Indonesia; Pandangan Para Ahli Dan Aktivois*, 291-92.

<sup>65</sup> Pimpinan Pusat Muhammadiyah, *Negara Pancasila Sebagai Darul Ahdi Wa Syahadah* (Makassar: Muktamam Muhammadiyah Ke-47, 2015), 12.

*Peradaban Indonesia dan Dunia (Strengthening Islam Nusantara for Indonesian and World Civilization).*<sup>66</sup>

## **TOWARDS INTEGRATIVE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN ISLAMIC AND STATE POLITICS**

The inclusive and integrative renewal starts from the ideas of Muslim intellectuals by articulating the ideas of political Islam through broader and more relevant mechanisms on program making. In addition, it contains concrete contents towards socio-economics and politics' development and improvement. For Bahtiar Effendy, utilizing non-government institutions, mass media, publishing, state institutions, and relevant power centres, to achieve Islamic social-political goals is a logical step. During the New Order era, for example, Department of Religion, Abdurrahman Wahid, Yusuf Hasyim, Hamam Ja'far, Soleh Widodo, and others introduced community development programs through pesantren. Adi Sasono formed the Institute of Development Studies (LSP) in 1980s. The leaders of the pesantren and IAIN graduates established the Pesantren and Community Development Association (P3M). Nurcholish Madjid pioneered the establishment of Paramadina Endowment Foundation. M. Dawam Rahardjo founded the Institute for the Study of Religion and Philosophy (LSAF). Amien Rais and Watik established the Center for Strategy and Policy Studies (PPSK). Moreover, many other figures pioneered various Islamic study groups on campus, while also utilized already established organizations, such as, Muhammadiyah and NU.<sup>67</sup>

Appreciation addressed to NU, Muhammadiyah, and other non-governmental organizations as political relations between Islam and the State seem to be more inclusive and integrated. It can be seen

---

<sup>66</sup> Hijrian A. Prihantoro, "Islam Nusantara Dan Filsafat Orientasi Bangsa; Dialektika Modernitas Beragama Dalam Negara Berbudaya," *Millah* XVI, no. 2 (2017): 209.

<sup>67</sup> Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 216-26.

that NU and Muhammadiyah are two most authoritative institutions in accommodating collective aspirations among Indonesian Muslims; thus, both of them positively represent a large proportion of Indonesian Muslims, as the organizations spread to village level. Through this network, further efforts to socialize and realize social-political agendas are easier.<sup>68</sup>

Studies show that Islamic political attitude and the State looks harmonious as the State has made policies which are in-line with socio-economical and political interests of Muslims during the New Order era. It then can be broadly categorized into four accommodative types, namely:

### **1. Structural/Bureaucratic Accommodation**

It is very visible and striking that this type recruits Islamic thinkers and reformers, as well as political activists into the bureaucracy (executive boards),<sup>69</sup> for instance, Abdul Gafur, Akbar Tanjung, Bustanul Arifin, Saleh Afif, Azwar Anas, Hasrul Harahap, Arifin Siregar, Syamsudin Sumintapura, Sya'adillah Mursid, and Baharsyah. These figures were appointed into ministerial positions.<sup>70</sup> It indicates developments that strengthen the structural position of Islam in the bureaucracy. Additionally, it also aids to launch ideas and aggregation of Islamic interests that are very substantive in its structural accommodation. For instance, Munawir Sjadzali presented in the national political arena when he was appointed as Minister of Religion in 1983.<sup>71</sup> The role he had presented in national politics was to connect between public schools and madrassas, state Islamic universities and others (under the Ministry of National Education). It was formulated in the Joint Decree of three ministries; Ministry of Education and Culture, the Ministry of Religion and the Ministry of

---

<sup>68</sup> Effendy, 219.

<sup>69</sup> Effendy, 273–78.

<sup>70</sup> Effendy, 276.

<sup>71</sup> Hendro Prasetyo and Ali dan Munhanif, *Islam Dan Civil Society* (Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2002), 260.

the interior in June 5, 1975.<sup>72</sup> When Munawir Sjadzali was appointed Minister of Religion in 1983, the Joint Decree of the three ministers had been refined to help him working.

Structural accommodation after the reformation by far shows that the political power of Islam has substantially contributed to politics in Indonesia. Over the years, ministerial cabinet of various presidential eras, i.e. BJ Habibie, KH. Abdurrahman Wahid, Megawati Soekarnoputri, Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono and Joko Widodo, have a lot of substantive Islamic activists and thinkers.

## **2. Legislative Accommodation**

Bahtiar Effendy mapped 5 important things related to state legislative accommodation towards Islam in the New Order, namely:<sup>73</sup>

- a. passed the National Education Law (UUPN) in 1989.
- b. granted the enactment of the Religious Courts Act in 1989 and the Compilation of Islamic Law in 1991.
- c. changed hijab policy in 1991.
- d. issued ministerial-level joint decisions regarding Amil Zakat, Infak and Sadaqah Board (BAZIS) in 1991
- e. eliminated Social Donation Award in 1993.

## **3. Infrastructural Accommodation**

One of the main evidences of infrastructural accommodation is the State's willingness to build mosque. It was a request of Indonesian Ullema Council in 1990s on funding 1,000 Muslim preachers to transmigration areas. Besides, the State also supported and made possible the construction of Islamic banks, for example, Bank Muamalat Indonesia (BMI) in 1991.<sup>74</sup> Mosque establishment continued to Reformation era. The activities of the Islamic

---

<sup>72</sup> Prasetyo and dan Munhanif, 74.

<sup>73</sup> Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 278–306; Prasetyo and dan Munhanif, *Islam Dan Civil Society*, 184–87.

<sup>74</sup> Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 303–6.

organizations congress nowadays are formally and materially supported by the State, especially on the development of the Islamic Bank which receives infrastructural accommodation.

#### **4. Cultural Accommodation**

Cultural accommodation is an ongoing discourse as Pancasila has Islamic idioms, such as, *adil* (fair) words, *adab* (manners), *rakyat* (people), *hikmah* (wisdom), *musyawarah* (deliberation) and *wakil* (representation).<sup>75</sup> Islamic cultural accommodation indirectly adorns a lot of orders; therefore, the State seems accommodating to Islam. Moreover, the Islamic model which is part of the orders is not aimed to fight for legal-formal and exclusive position, but it rather aims to fight for substantialism rights.

### **RELIGIOUS NATION STATE**

Islamic politics in Indonesia has been part of the orders in its application, although previously Islam and the State experience numerous disputes. In this case, Effendy labels it as the transformation of Islamic political thought and practice in Indonesia. Islamic politics in typology and movement can generally be divided into three patterns, such as, substantive-integrative, formalist-integrative, and ideological-formalist. First, substantive-integrative is a pattern which is locally or nationally based to form an Islamic society. This movement has no aspiration to change the form of the state or formalize Islamic law in legislation. It mostly aims to integrate Islamic legal norms into national law. Thus, Pancasila as an ideology is considered final and precisely compatible with Islamic principles. Secondly, the formalist-integrative style is the opposite. It enforces Islamic law to be made into legally-formally applied; yet it does not adopt any state form. It can even accept consensus. Third, ideological-formalist is a national and transnational-based style which clearly

---

<sup>75</sup> Effendy, 306-10.

aims at Islamic state and realizes *Khilafah* (a joint or transnational government).<sup>76</sup>

Nowadays, the forerunner of ideas and movements is still attached to the religious organization's movements, even in minority movements like in "NKRI Bersyariah" movement. This term was first introduced by M. Rizieq Syihab in his work *Wawasan Kebangsaan Menuju "NKRI Bersyariah"* (National Insight Towards Indonesian Sharia). The movement emerged and was massively introduced by M. Rizieq Syihab in the Islamic Action III on December 2, 2016 (known as the 212 Action) and again strengthened at the 212 Reunion, on December 2, 2017.<sup>77</sup> The affirmation in realizing "NKRI Bersyariah" was reemphasized during 21<sup>st</sup> anniversary of Islamic (FPI). Syihab in his mandate about the concept of the Sharia NKRI emphasized that:

*"Amanat saya selaku Imam Besar Front Pembela Islam, kepada seluruh pengurus, aktifis dan kader FPI dari seluruh sayap juangnya di seluruh Indonesia. Agar diusia FPI yang ke-21 ini, FPI harus lebih memantapkan langkah perjuangan untuk merajut persaudaraan dan menjaga bangsa serta negara dengan dakwah dan hizbah serta jihad konstitusional. Untuk mewujudkan NKRI Bersyariah dalam kehidupan beragama, berbangsa dan bernegara."<sup>78</sup>*

Shihab further explained:

*"dalam dekret Presiden Soekarno 5 Juli 1959 juga telah dinyatakan dengan tegas dan jelas bahwasanya pancasila dijiwai Piagam Jakarta dan menjadi satu kesatuan konstitusi yang tidak terpisahkan. Sehingga roh syari'at Islam dalam piagam Jakarta menjadi roh Pancasila sejati yang tidak boleh dipisahkan sekali-kali dari Pancasila. Catat, sekali lagi catat, bahwa Pancasila yang berintikan Ketuhanan*

---

<sup>76</sup> These terms come from Ali Sadiqin in looking at the enforcement of Islamic sharia in Indonesia. Ali Sadiqin, "Genealogi Gerakan Penegakan Syari'at Islam Di Indonesia," *Al-Mazahib* 3, no. 1 (2015): 33-36.

<sup>77</sup> Satrio Arismunandar and (Editor), *NKRI Bersyariah Atau Ruang Publik Yang Manusiawi? Tanggapan 21 Pakar Terhadap Gagasan Denny JA* (tt: Cerah Budaya Indonesia, 2019), 1.

<sup>78</sup> TV Front titled "Milad FPI 21" on August 24, 2019. <http://youtu.be/Ju4wvLBINdE>. buka dari menit 5:12:10 sampai menit 5:12:55. Accessed 09-09-2019 at 14:00.

*Yang Maha Esa adalah dasar negara Republik Indonesia, bukan pilar negara... Mereka yang menyebut Pancasila sebagai pilar negara tidak paham konstitusi bahkan gagal paham tentang dasar negara Republik Indonesia".*<sup>79</sup>

Muhammad Rizieq Syihab mentioned a clear and firm statement which concludes that Indonesia can be a Tauhid state.<sup>80</sup> However, the success of Islamic politics is actually not in the legal-formal struggle or movement in becoming an Islamic state or realizing the "Unified" Republic of Indonesia. It is more on the substantial movement in its substantive -integrative acts<sup>81</sup> which recently seems friendly with the State, as seen in socio-religious organizations, such as, Muhammadiyah and NU. The Islamic political movement substantially can be seen from the accommodative point of view towards Islam. Additionally, in the history of the State's leadership, Indonesia was led by KH. Abdurrahman Wahid, an ulama, from 1999 to 2001. In current presidential era, another ulama was elected as Vice President, KH. Amin Ma'ruf. The accommodational politics includes structural/bureaucratic accommodation,<sup>82</sup> legislation<sup>83</sup>,

---

<sup>79</sup> *Ibid.*, minutes 5:15:30 to 5:16:59.

<sup>80</sup> *Ibid.*, open from 5:15:17. The explanation of "NKRI Bersyariah" has been alluded to by previous researchers as an archetype. See more Ali Akhbar Abaib Mas Rabbani Lubis, "Rethinking the Book of Al-'Aql Al-Siyasi Al-'Arabi and Indonesian Political Phenomenon," *Jurnal Penelitian* 17, no. 1 (2020): 67-80.

<sup>81</sup> Borrowing the term Ali Sodikin. Lihat Sodikin, "Genealogi Gerakan Penegakan Syari'at Islam Di Indonesia," 33.

<sup>82</sup> For example in the Jokowi-Kalla government in 2014-2019 accommodatively involved Islamic groups in his cabinets such as Khofifah Indar Parawasita (from PKB and including Nahdiyyin circles) as Social Minister, Lukman Hakim Saifuddin (from PPP and including Nahdiyyin) as Minister of Religion, Imam Nahrawi as Minister of Youth and Sports, Muhajir Effendy (one of Muhammadiyah's figures) as Minister of Education and Culture and in the Jokowi-Ma'ruf government shifted to Coordinating Minister for Human Development and Culture (PMK).

<sup>83</sup> For example, the ratification of Law Number 18 of 2019 concerning Pesantren or commonly referred to as Pesantren Law at the DPR plenary meeting on Tuesday, September 24, 2019.

infrastructure<sup>84</sup>, and culture<sup>85</sup>. Therefore, substantial Islamic politics has been part of many State's policies. Islamic politics has also greatly influenced State's policies without having to change the state into an Islamic State. Abdurrahman Wahid (Gusdur) in his statement mentioned that:

*"Gerakan Islam harus mempunyai kemampuan untuk mengakomodasi persoalan-persoalan nasional penting bagi negara kita".*<sup>86</sup>

Hence, Indonesia is called a religious nation state which, according to Effendy, is substantial/inclusive and integrative. In addition, accommodational politics is a logical step to achieve Islamic socio-political goals.<sup>87</sup> Effendy points out that the relationship between Islam and the State is not merely a secularization recognition or a solution, in contrary:

*"Sejauh negara, baik secara ideologis maupun politis, berjalan di atas sebuah sistem nilai yang tidak bertentangan dengan ajaran-ajaran Islam, maka cukup bagi para aktifis politik Islam untuk menyatakan loyalitas dan dukungan mereka terhadapnya".*<sup>88</sup>

Accordingly, consolidation will heavily depend on proportional representation of Muslims in the country's political institutions and national commitment on a "Unified" Republic of Indonesia is not a secular state.<sup>89</sup> Moreover, the current legal system that is positivist Pancasila actually has adopted the nation's best aspects and does not emphasize on legal systems like Continental Europes or Anglo Saxon. It rather takes good things while adjusts to

---

<sup>84</sup> Misalnya Presiden Joko Widodo yang menandatangani Undang-Undang Nomor 8 Tahun 2019 tentang Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Haji dan Umrah pada tanggal 26 April 2019.

<sup>85</sup> Of course, the most striking is the concept of the *Islam Nuantara* that was carried by NU so that the movement to maintain the culture of the archipelago is part of cultural accommodation.

<sup>86</sup> Hisanori, *Agama Dan Peradaban*, 136.

<sup>87</sup> Effendy, *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*, 212 dan 215.

<sup>88</sup> Effendy, 334.

<sup>89</sup> Effendy, 338.

ongoing socio-religious conditions. Therefore, it is in-line with Moh. Mahfudz MD in his statement.

*“Sistem hukum Pancasila mengambil segi-segi terbaik dari rechtsstaat (eropa kontinental) dan the rule of law (anglo saxon) yang didalamnya bertemu dalam sebuah ikatan prismatic dan interaktif prinsip kepastian hukum dan keadilan substansial”.*<sup>90</sup>

Accordingly, a religious nation state does not neglect religion as an inseparable part of the state; yet, it does not choose one of the religions as the foundation of the state. Religion and State both operate on a value system that is not conflicting one another. Bahtiar Effendy hopes that the journey of Islamic political thought and practice in Indonesia will always progress according to latest context and need. It does not necessarily carry out the same activities or returns under the shadow of deep-rooted believed, namely establishing an Islamic (theocratic) state or creating a secular state.<sup>91</sup>

## CONCLUSION

Bahtiar Effendy is a Muslim scholar. He was a professor of political science at UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta. He also served as the chairperson of PP Muhammadiyah. Effendy died in November 21, 2019 and left many works. One of them is an old book, very famous, and no longer reprinted entitled *Islam and the State; Transforming Islamic Political Thought and Practices in Indonesia*. The most interesting part in the book is to understand Islamic politics in Indonesia.

Substantially, Islamic politics has succeeded in making many contributions to Indonesia. Therefore, Effendy presents the nature of harmony between Islam and the State under four categories of accommodation in its movement, namely; structural, legislative, infrastructure and cultural accommodation. It means that relevance and reflection on Effendy's thought do not assume that secularization

---

<sup>90</sup> MD, *Perdebatan Hukum Tata Negara; Pasca Amandemen Konstitusi*, 8.

<sup>91</sup> Bahtiar Effendy, “Disartikulasi Pemikiran Politik Islam”, dalam Olivier Roy, *Gagalnya Islam Politik*, ed. Harimurti dan Qamaruddin SF Terj (Jakarta: Serambi, n.d.), V–XII.

is the best solution. On the other hand, they have indicated substantialism or inclusive-integrative approach. Furthermore, the politics of accommodation is a logical step to achieve Islamic socio-political goals. The contribution of Effendy's thought through shifting the paradigm of Islamic politics (from formalism-legalism to substantialism) is enough to provide ethical/moral substance of the thought. Thus, Indonesian state deserves to be called the Religious Nation State.

In the end, Islamic politics that has been confronted can eventually be drawn into significant values for the future of the state. The best will have to include a policy in the state itself which certainly not by promotes religious symbols, but also incorporates substantial religious moral/ethics.

## REFERENCES

- Adrianti, Devi. "Sekularisme Sebagai Dasar Konseptualisasi (Telaah Atas Disertasi Noorhaidi Hasan, Bahtiar Effendy Dan Masdar Hilmy Yang Memakai Pendekatan Ilmu Sosial Terhadap Politik Islam Di Indonesia)." *In Right: Jurnal Agama Dan Hak Azazi Manusia* 3, no. 1 (2013).
- Arismunandar, Satrio, and (Editor). *NKRI Bersyariah Atau Ruang Publik Yang Manusiawi? Tanggapan 21 Pakar Terhadap Gagasan Denny JA*. tt: CeraH Budaya Indonesia, 2019.
- Asshiddiqie, Jimly. *Pengantar Hukum Tata Negara*. 8th ed. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers, 2016.
- Baidhawiy, Zakiyuddin. "Pancasila Tauhid Sosial Dalam Kehidupan Berbangsa Dan Bernegara." *Maarif* 11, no. 1 (2016).
- Effendy, Bahtiar. "Islam and The State: The Transformation of Islamic Political Ideas and Practices in Indonesia." The Ohio State University, 1994.
- — —. "Islam and the State in Indonesia: Munawir Sjadzali and the Development of a New Theological Underpinning of Political

- Islam." *Studia Islamica* 2, no. 2 (1995).
- — —. *Islam Dan Negara; Transformasi Pemikiran Dan Praktik Politik Islam Di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Paramadina, 1998.
- Fachry, Ali dan, and Bahtiar Effendy. *Merambah Jalan Baru Islam; Rekonstruksi Pemikiran Islam Masa Orde Baru*. III. Bandung: mizan, 1992.
- Hisanori. *Agama Dan Peradaban*. Jakarta: Dian Rakyat, 2011.
- Humaidi, Zuhri. "Islam Dan Pancasila: Pergulatan Islam Dan Negara Periode Kebijakan Asas Tunggal." *Kontekstualitas* 25, no. 2 (2010).
- Irvan, Tasnur, and Zulkarnain. "Akar Dan Perkembangan Konservatisme Islam Dalam Perpolitikan Indonesia." *Jurnal Review Politik* 9, no. 1 (2019).
- Kahin, George McTurnan. *Nationalism and Revolution in Indonesia*. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1952.
- Lubis, Ali Akhbar Abaib Mas Rabbani. "Politik Ruang NKRI: BPUPK Sampai Majelis Konstituante." *Shar-E: Jurnal Ekonomi Hukum Syariah* 6, no. 1 (2020).
- — —. "Rethinking the Book of Al-'Aql Al-Siyasi Al-'Arabi and Indonesian Political Phenomenon." *Jurnal Penelitian* 17, no. 1 (2020).
- Maarif, Ahmad Syafii. *Islam Dan Masalah Kenegaraan; Studi Tentang Percaturan Dalam Konstituante*. Jakarta: LP3ES, 1985.
- Makhrus. *Dinamika Hukum Islam Di Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: IERPRO KREASINDO, 2019.
- MD, Moh. Mahfud. *Perdebatan Hukum Tata Negara; Pasca Amandemen Konstitusi*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers, 2010.
- Muhammadiyah, Pimpinan Pusat. *Negara Pancasila Sebagai Darul Ahdi Wa Syahadah*. Makassar: Muktamar Muhammadiyah Ke-47, 2015.
- Nurcholish, Madjid, and dkk. *Islam Universal*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2007.

Prasetyo, Hendro, and Ali dan Munhanif. *Islam Dan Civil Society*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2002.

Prihantoro, Hijrian A. "Islam Nusantara Dan Filsafat Orientasi Bangsa; Dialektika Modernitas Beragama Dalam Negara Berbudaya." *Millah* XVI, no. 2 (2017).

RI, PPP MPR. *Islam, Nasionalisme, Dan Masa Depan Negara Bangsa Indonesia; Pandangan Para Ahli Dan Aktiwis*. PPP MPR RI, 2009.

Ridwan, MK. "Penafsiran Pancasila Dalam Perspektif Islam: Peta Konsep Integrasi." *Dalogia* 15, no. 2 (2017).

Roy, Olivier. *Gagalnya Islam Politik*. Edited by Harimurti dan Qamaruddin SF Terj. Jakarta: Serambi, n.d.

Sodiqin, Ali. "Genealogi Gerakan Penegakan Syari'at Islam Di Indonesia." *Al-Mazahib* 3, no. 1 (2015).

Soekarno. "Memudakan Pengertian Islam", *Dalam Di Bawah Bendera Revolusi*. IV., 1965.

<https://jakarta.tribunnews.com/2019/11/21/profil-bahtiar-effendy-ketua-pp-muhammadiyah-meninggal-usia-60-sd-di-ambarawa-kuliah-di-as>. Diakses pada 11 Mei 2020 pada pukul 03: 28.

<https://m.merdeka.com/profil/indonesia/b/bahtiar-effendy/> di Unduh pada 09 Januari 2020 Pukul 22:13.

<https://scholar.google.com/citations?hl=id&user=CG8VfvAAAAAJ>

<https://tirto.id/bahtiar-effendy-meninggal-profil-dan-jejak-kariernya-el4w>, diakses pada 11 Mei 2020 pada pukul 02: 44.

<http://youtu.be/Ju4wvLBINdE>, diakses pada 15-09-2019 pukul 14:00.